

# Falsafe va Kalam-e Eslami (Philosophy & Kalam)

Semi-Annual Academic Journal

Faculty of Theology & Islamic Studies  
University of Tehran

New Period, Vol. 50, No. 1, Spring & Summer 2017

---

**Publisher:** Faculty of Theology & Islamic Studies, University of Tehran

**Managing Director:** Majid Maarif

**Editor-in-Chief:** Abd al-Rasul Kashfi

**English Editor:** Abd al-Rasul Kashfi

**Persian Editor:** Mahdi Azimi

## **Editorial Board:**

Gholam Reza Awani	Professor, Iranian Institute of hilosophy (Iran)
Ahmad Beheshti	Professor, University of Tehran (Iran)
Vincent Brummer	Professor, Utrecht University (Netherlands)
Qorban Elmi	Associate Professor, University of Tehran (Iran)
Amir Abbas Alizamani	Associate Professor, University of Tehran (Iran)
Ahad Faramarz Qaramaleki	Professor, University of Tehran (Iran)
Najafqoli Habibi	Associate Professor, University of Tehran (Iran)
Mohsen Jawadi	Associate Professor, Qom University (Iran)
Abd al-Rasul Kashfi	Associate Professor, University of Tehran (Iran)
Muhammad Legenhausen	Professor, Research Institute of Imam Khomeini (Iran)
Hossein Hooshangi	Associate Professor, Imam Sadiq University
Seyyed Yahya Yathrebi	Professor, Allameh Tabatabayi University (Iran)

- **Design and Typesetting:** Azar Aghamirza
- **Layout:** zeynab mirazizi
- **Print:** Tehran University Press
- **Address:** Faculty of Theology & Islamic Studies, Motahhari St., Tehran, Iran
- **P.O.B:** 15766 – 4411
- **Website:** [jitp.ut.ac.ir](http://jitp.ut.ac.ir)
- **Email:** [jitp@ut.ac.ir](mailto:jitp@ut.ac.ir)
- **Phone:** 098-021-42762151
- **Fax:** 42762951



**“Philosophy and Kalam” has been licensed as a scientific research semi-annual academic journal since October the 11<sup>th</sup>, 2010 by the Commission for Evaluation of Iranian Scientific Journals, The Ministry of Science, Research and Technology through the letter numbered 3/11/2795**

**“Philosophy and Kalam” has been indexed in international website of “Philosopher’s Index” since June the 13<sup>th</sup>, 2012. All the articles of this journal and their abstracts can be accessed through this website. The website address is:  
<http://philindex.org>**

**Philosophy and Kalam can be accessed through the following domestic websites:  
[www.isc.gov.ir](http://www.isc.gov.ir)  
[www.SID.ir](http://www.SID.ir)  
[www.noormags.com](http://www.noormags.com)  
[www.magiran.com](http://www.magiran.com)**

## **Submission Guidelines:**

- 1. All essays submitted for publication should be based on scholarly research representing new ideas in the fields of philosophy and Kalam. Review articles on new topics in philosophy and Kalam and book reviews are also recommended. Book reviews must include title, publisher, city of publication, and year of publication of the book.**
- 2. The essays should not already be published in another journal.**
- 3. The Editorial Board reserves the right to accept or reject the essays, to make all editorial changes as deemed necessary, and to rearrange the articles in the order which it finds appropriate.**
- 4. Submissions should not exceed 6000 words and must include title, introduction, literature review, essay body, conclusion, references, two abstracts (preferably less than 150 words each, in Farsi and English), and two lists of keywords (in Farsi and English).**
- 5. The accepted file format is Microsoft Word 2010, with single line spacing and font size of 12. All submissions are made online at the journal website: <http://jitp.ut.ac.ir>.**
- 6. The list of references at the end of article should appear in alphabetical order and follow the Modern Language Association (MLA) style as follows:**
  - a. To quote: give the author's surname, date of publication and page number in parenthesis, right after the quotation. In case the author you are quoting from has more than one publication in the year you are referring to, distinguish them by writing a, b, c, etc. after the date.**
  - b. In case of books: author's surname, first name, title in italics, translator's name, place of publication, publisher name, date of publication.**
  - c. In case of articles: author's surname, first name, title, journal name in italics, date of publication, issue no., vol. no., page no.**
  - d. In case of Internet sources: author's surname, first name, date of article, article title, journal title, vol.(issue), pages, date information retrieved, from URL.**

**Abstracts**

**In**

**English**

## Contents

<b>Ibn Taymiyyah and Robert Adams on the Relationship between Religion and Ethics</b>	<b>1</b>
<i>Ali Reza Aram, Mohsen javadi</i>	
<b>Soren Kierkegaard on Truth and Faith</b>	<b>3</b>
<i>Shahla Eslami</i>	
<b>Avicenna on Potential Knowledge</b>	<b>5</b>
<i>Reza Akbari, Fatemeh Shahinfar, Mohammad Saeedi mehr</i>	
<b>The Theoretical Foundations of Deterministic Emanation in of Avicenna's Philosophy</b>	<b>7</b>
<i>Mohammad Hosseini</i>	
<b>Abd al-Razzaq Lahiji on the Subjectivity of Individuality</b>	<b>9</b>
<i>Maryam Salem</i>	
<b>Propositional Logic in Al-Farabi and Avicenna</b>	<b>11</b>
<i>Amin Shahverdi</i>	
<b>Evaluative Doxastic Practices: Moral Epistemology of Robert Merrihew Adams Reconsidered</b>	<b>13</b>
<i>Mehdi Ghafourian, Masoud Sadeghi</i>	
<b>The Analysis and Evaluation of the Conservativeness in Inferentialism Theory of Meaning</b>	<b>15</b>
<i>Morteza Mezginejad, Lotfolah Nabavi, Seyyed Mohammad Ali Hojati</i>	

## **Ibn Taymiyyah and Robert Adams on the Relationship between Religion and Ethics**

**Ali Reza Aram<sup>1</sup>, Mohsen javadi<sup>2</sup>**

*(Received: 9 May 2016- Accepted: 14 December 2016)*

### **Abstract**

The present paper aims to explore the relationship between religion and ethics from the perspective of Ibn Taymiyyah and Robert Adams. For this purpose, this article investigates comprehensively the standpoints of these two thinkers in four parts. The results of the research reveal that from the perspective of Ibn Taymiyyah, ethics is dependent upon religion in four dimensions (ontological, epistemological, semantic, and normative). According to Adams, although ethics is dependent on religion in ontological and normative dimensions, they are autonomous regarding epistemological and semantic dimensions. The critical analysis of these two perspectives results in two conclusions. First: there are considerable similarities between these two viewpoints prevailing over their differences. Second: these two thinkers have not provided a proper definition of the relationship between ethics and religion and have not clarified the ethical interaction between God and man.

**Keywords:** Ibn Taymiyyah, Robert Adams, Religion and Ethics, Religious Good and Evil, Rational Good and Evil.

---

1. PhD Candidate of Ethics, University of Qom (Corresponding Author);  
Email: alireza.5988@yahoo.com

2. Professor of Philosophy, University of Qom;

Email: moh\_javadi@yahoo.com





## Soren Kierkegaard on Truth and Faith

Shahla Eslami<sup>1</sup>

*(Received: 27 November 2016- Accepted: 14 December 2016)*

### Abstract

Soren Kierkegaard considers truth from two aspects, objective and subjective, and accordingly classifies it. With respect to the importance of individual and his/her choice, truth is subjective. From the perspective of objective truth, truth is conceived as an object which is somehow related to the subject. From the perspective of subjective truth, the truth, itself, is concerned, even if it is not appeared objectively. Now the main question is that of the relation between truth and faith. Subjective truth is an eternal truth connecting to the existence of man. Kierkegaard's discussion of truth aims at offering a justification of faith, in his special sense of faith, through showing that the believer is subjectively "in the truth". Faith or subjectively being in the truth is the highest truth attainable for an existing individual.

**Keywords:** Soren Kierkegaard, Existentialism, Objective Truth, Subjective Truth, Faith.

---

1. Assistant Professor, Department of Philosophy, Science and Research Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran, Email: sh-eslami@srbiau.ac.ir.



## Avicenna on Potential Knowledge

Reza Akbari<sup>1</sup>, Fatemeh Shahinfar<sup>2</sup>, Mohammad Saeedi mehr<sup>3</sup>

*(Received: 13 August 2016- Accepted: 14 December 2016)*

### Abstract

Distinguishing between potentiality and actuality, Aristotle solved many contradictions among past philosophies. Avicenna used this distinction to solve some epistemic problems. He introduces the term potential knowledge whose instances we can find in his philosophical works. Knowledge of the implicit conclusion in the premises, knowledge of some logical rules, knowledge of the interior parts of a quiddity, knowledge of the self-justified propositions, knowledge of reasoning, and self-awareness are instances of potential knowledge in Avicenna's philosophical works. The instances of potential knowledge have two criteria in common. First, we have them in our inside existence; so we need nothing for making them actual but mental intention or mental intention accompanied with inner contemplation. Second, all these instances are implicit implications of a more general knowledge. As the knowledge of reasoning and self-awareness need only inner contemplation to become actual, they are more actual than the other instances; so the potential knowledge is gradational

**Keywords:** Avicenna, Intentionality, Potential Knowledge, Actual Knowledge

---

1. Professor of Islamic philosophy and theology, Imam Sadiq University, Tehran, Iran  
(corresponding author); Email: r.akbari@isu.ac.ir.

2. PhD Candidate, Islamic philosophy, Tarbiat Modares University, Tehran, Iran;  
Email: shahinfar66@gmail.com

3. Professor of Philosophy, Tarbiat Modares University, Tehran, Iran;  
Email: saeedimehr@modares.ac.ir



## The Theoretical Foundations of Deterministic Emanation in of Avicenna's Philosophy<sup>1</sup>

Mohammad Hosseini<sup>2</sup>

(Received: 4 July 2016- Accepted: 14 December 2016)

### Abstract

The theory of emanation ( *udur*) is one of the solutions proposed in the Islamic philosophy for the problem of causation relation. This theory originates from the Neo-Platonist philosophy. In Avicenna's works, this theory is sometimes based on the 'determination of the effect by its adequate cause', and sometimes on the notion of 'causal necessity'. This article shows that Avicenna has argued for the theory of emanation based on a new model he provides for the latter notion. Avicenna discusses a new analysis for the relation between cause and effect according to which effect should be 'possible by itself'. He argues that a being which is possible by itself does not come to existence unless it is necessitated—i.e., it comes out of the mere possibility—by some other thing that is 'necessary by itself'. Therefore, 'necessitation' plays the most crucial role in bringing something that is possible by itself to existence.

**Keywords:** Emanation, Deterministic Emanation, Creation, Necessity, Tripartite Division.

---

1. From the master's thesis titled: The Theory of Emanation in Neo-Platonic and Avicennian Theology.  
2. MA in of Islamic Theology, Email: h.haeri.m@gmail.com.



## **Abd al-Razzaq Lahiji on the Subjectivity of Individuality**

**Maryam Salem<sup>1</sup>**

*(Received: 10 September 2016- Accepted: 14 December 2016)*

### **Abstract**

Individuality, one of the important metaphysical issues among peripatetic, illuminational, transcendental philosophers, as well as Imami and Ash'ari scholars, has also drawn the attention of Abd al-Razzaq Lahiji. The theological views of khaje, Eiji, Jorjani and Davani make Lahiji analyze and evaluate the views of peripatetic philosophers on this issue. Lahiji believes that individuality is subjective since it does not have an independent existence in the external world and is not but the very specific existence of the thing and its individual essence. Like the existence, Individuality is unified with the essence in the external world and is separated from it only in mental analysis, and in the mind, the essence is attributed to the existence. In this article, it is shown that there is no difference between Lahiji and Mulla Sadra views on the definition of the individuality, the manner of its being and what it depends on. Both of them maintain that individuality is the especial existence of the thing, the existence which is the same as its reality and its external existence.

**Keywords:** Individuality, Existence, Mulla Sadra, Abd al-Razzaq Lahiji

---

1. Assistant Professor, University of Shahid Beheshti, Iran;

Email: m\_salem@sbu.ac.ir.





## Propositional Logic in Al-Farabi and Avicenna

Amin Shahverdi<sup>1</sup>

(Received: 25 July 2016- Accepted: 14 December 2016)

### Abstract

The first chapter of the paper discusses the concept of “Propositionality” attributed to logical arguments, and by adopting the criterion introduced by *Christopher Martin*, the “Propositionality” of logical arguments is elaborated based on the Principle of Substitution in compound propositions. The second chapter discusses the viewpoints of *Kamran Karimullah* on the “non-Propositionality” of Al-Farabi’s conditional arguments and “Propositionality” of Avicenna to reach a judgment. In this approach, the “non-Propositionality” of Al-Farabi’s logical teaching is confirmed not only in its dialectical context, but is also confirmed beyond it. The chapter continues by showing that Avicenna’s viewpoints on the conditional arguments and propositions maintain differs somehow from modern “propositional logic” despite satisfying the criterion of propositionality.

**Keywords:** Avicenna, Al-Farabi, The Criterion of Propositionality, Principle of Substitution, Propositional Logic.

---

1. PhD in Philosophy, University of Isfahan;

Email: Amin.shahverdy@gmail.com.



## **Evaluative Doxastic Practices: Moral Epistemology of Robert Merrihew Adams Reconsidered**

**Mehdi Ghafourian<sup>1</sup>, Masoud Sadeghi<sup>2</sup>**

*(Received: 26 June 2016- Accepted: 14 December 2016)*

### **Abstract**

Robert Adams, Inspired by William Alston's theory of doxastic practice, forms his moral epistemology and coins the term of "evaluative doxastic practice". The inputs of evaluative doxastic practice are historical and cultural tradition, as well as feelings, emotions, inclinations and desires. These inputs accompanied with thinking about them bring about moral beliefs as outputs of evaluative doxastic practices. In Adams' view, moral faith provides the confidence base of moral beliefs formed thorough evaluative doxastic practices. Moral faith is necessary because the moral beliefs are not above any kind of reasonable doubt, Although there are not any reasons against them.

**Keywords:** Doxastic Practice, Evaluative Doxastic Practice, Moral Belief, Moral Faith.

---

1. Graduate of philosophy, Islamic Azad university, Science and Research Branch, Tehran, Iran (Corresponding Author); Email: mehdi3ph@yahoo.com.  
2. Assistant professor, Tehran university, theology faculty; Email: masoudsadeghi@ut.ac.ir



## **The Analysis and Evaluation of the Conservativeness in Inferentialism Theory of Meaning**

**Morteza Mezginejad<sup>1</sup>, Lotfolah Nabavi<sup>2</sup>, Seyyed Mohammad Ali Hojati<sup>3</sup>**

*(Received: 2 July 2016- Accepted: 14 December 2016)*

### **Abstract**

The logical constants are defined by operational rules in the inferentialism theory of meaning. Arthur Prior's counterexample (Tonk) makes a major challenge for the inferentialism. He shows that every arbitrary operational rule can describe a logical constant and this makes logical constants defective and incompatible with the system. In response to this problem, Belnap Offers conservativeness and uniqueness requirements for the operational rules. In this paper, we have evaluated the conservativeness requirement. The main question investigated is "how the conservativeness as a criterion provides the necessary and sufficient conditions for logical constant definition?" The hypothesis that we are to establish is the inability to achieve the definition of logical constant by conservativeness requirement.

**Keywords:** Conservativeness, Belnap, Inferentialism, Meaning, Logical Constants, Operational Rules

---

1. Assistant Professor, University of Birjand (Corresponding Author);

Email: mezginejad@birjand.ac.ir.

2. Associate professor, Tarbiat Modares University;

Email: nabavi\_1@modares.ac.ir.

3. Associate Professor, Tarbiat Modares University;

Email: hojatima@modares.ac.ir.