In the Name of God

Faculty of Theology & Islamic Studies University of Tehran

Falsafe va Kalam-e Eslami (Philosophy & Kalam)

The Scientific & Research Journal of the Faculty of Theology & Islamic Studies

> Vol. 48, No. 2 Autumn& winter 2015-2016

In the Name of God Falsafe va Kalam-e Eslami (Philosophy & Kalam) Semi-Annual Academic Journal

Faculty of Theology & Islamic Studies University of Tehran New Period, Vol. 48, No. 2, Autumn & winter 2015-2016

Publisher: Faculty of Theology & Islamic Studies, University of Tehran
Managing Director: Majid Maarif
Editor-in-Chief: Abd al-Rasul Kashfi
English Editor: Abd al-Rasul Kashfi
Persian Editor: Mahdi Azimi

Editorial Board:

Gholam Reza Awani	Professor, Iranian Institute of hilosophy (Iran)
Ahmad Beheshti	Professor, University of Tehran (Iran)
Vincent Brummer	Professor, Utrecht University (Netherlands)
Qorban Elmi	Associate Professor, University of Tehran (Iran)
AmirAbbas Alizamani	Associate Professor, University of Tehran (Iran)
Ahad Faramarz Qaramaleki	Professor, University of Tehran (Iran)
Najafqoli Habibi	Associate Professor, University of Tehran (Iran)
Mohsen Jawadi	Associate Professor, Qom University (Iran)
Abd al-Rasul Kashfi	Associate Professor, University of Tehran (Iran)
Muhammad Legenhausen	Professor, Research Institute of Imam
	Khomaini (Iran)
Hossein Hooshangi	Associate Professor, Imam Sadiq University
Seyyed Yahya Yathrebi	Professor, Allameh Tabatabyi University (Iran)

• Design and Typesetting: S. Mazaheri

- Layout: zeynab mirazizi
- **Print:** Tehran University Press
- Address: Faculty of Theology & Islamic Studies, Motahhari St., Tehran, Iran
- P.O.B: 15766 4411
- Website: jitp.ut.ac.ir
- Email: jitp@ut.ac.ir
- •Phone: 098-021-42762151
- Fax: 42762951

"Philosophy and Kalam" has been licensed as a scientific research semi-annual academic journal since October the 11th, 2010 by the Commission for Evaluation of Iranian Scientific Journals, The Ministry of Science, Research and Technology through the letter numbered 3/11/2795

"Philosophy and Kalam" has been indexed in international website of "Philosopher's Index" since June the 13th, 2012. All the articles of this journal and their abstracts can be accessed through this website. The website address is: http://philindex.org

Philosophy and Kalam can be accessed through the following domestic websites: www.isc.gov.ir www.SID.ir www.noormags.com www.magiran.com

Submission Guidelines:

- 1. All essays submitted for publication should be based on scholarly research representing new ideas in the fields of philosophy and Kalam. Review articles on new topics in philosophy and Kalam and book reviews are also recommended. Book reviews must include title, publisher, city of publication, and year of publication of the book.
- 2. The essays should not already be published in another journal.
- **3.** The Editorial Board reserves the right to accept or reject the assays, to make all editorial changes as deemed necessary, and to rearrange the articles in the order which it finds appropriate.
- 4. Submissions should not exceed 6000 words and must include title, introduction, literature review, essay body, conclusion, references, two abstracts (preferably less than 150 words each, in Farsi and English), and two lists of keywords (in Farsi and English).
- 5. The accepted file format is Microsoft Word 2010, with single line spacing and font size of 12. All submissions are made online at the journal website: http://jitp.ut.ac.ir.
- 6. The list of references at the end of article should appear in alphabetical order and follow the Modern Language Association (MLA) style as follows:
 - a. To quote: give the author's surname, date of publication and page number in parenthesis, right after the quotation. In case the author you are quoting from has more than one publication in the year you are referring to, distinguish them by writing a, b, c, etc. after the date.
 - b. In case of books: author's surname, first name, title in italics, translator's name, place of publication, publisher name, date of publication.
 - c. In case of articles: author's surname, first name, title, journal name in italics, date of publication, issue no., vol. no., page no.
 - d. In case of Internet sources: author's surname, first name, date of article, article title, journal title, vol.(issue), pages, date information retrieved, from URL.

Abstracts

In

English

Contents

A Critical Analysis of the Application of "Divine Wisdom" in Shi'ite Theology Janan Izadi	1
The William Leonard Rowe's Evolution of Views on Gratuitous Evil and Its Critical Remarks <i>Batool Zarkande, Amirabbas Alizamani</i>	2
The Consistency of Peripatetic and Illuminationist Philosophical Approaches on Issue of the Soul in Ibn Sina's view Shams Allah Seraj, Mahnaz Mozaffarifar	3
A Critical Edition of Al-Jili's Treatise on the Forth Figure Al-Lame fi al-Shakl al-Rabe Asadollah Fallahi	4
The Distinction of Two Aspects of Being in Ibn Sina Mohammad Bagher Ghomi	5
The Nature and Varieties of Death in the Works of Saint Augustine <i>Ghasem Kakaie, Mahbuobeh Jabbareh Nasero</i>	6
The Critical Analysis of Jeff Jordan's View on Religious Experience and its Naturalistic Explanation <i>Mansour Nasiri</i>	7

A Critical Analysis of the Application of "Divine Wisdom" in Shi'ite Theology

Janan Izadi¹ (Received: 24 May 2015- Accepted: 9 December2015)

Abstract

The attribute of Divine Wisdom is applied in Shi'ite Theology to prove some religious beliefs. Shi'ite theologians believe that providing the tools needed to achieve the Divine Purpose of the human beings' creation and removing the obstacles to it is necessary to God. Using logical analyses, this research investigates the sufficiency of the arguments based on Divine Wisdom in relation to the problems of the principle of Divine Grace, Divine Justice, the necessity of prophecy, the Imamate, and the resurrection. It seems that these arguments, because of having their roots in Divine Purpose, are not sufficient to prove the results.

Keywords: Divine Wisdom, The Methodology of Kalam, Divine Grace, Prophecy, Imamate, Resurrection

^{1.} Assistant Professor, Department of Islamic Philosophy, Faculty of Literature and Humanities, University of Isfahan, Email:dr.izadi2010@yahoo.com

The William Leonard Rowe's Evolution of Views on Gratuitous Evil and Its Critical Remarks

Batool Zarkande¹, Amirabbas Alizamani² (*Received: 5 April 2015- Accepted: 30 June 2015*)

Abstract

The contemporary philosopher of religion, William Leonard Rowe (1931), with emphasis on gratuitous evil, has tried to show a new version of an evidential argument from evil against God. In this article we, first, try to show a detailed description and documentation of Rowe's views and, then, have some critical remarks on it. In describing his views, we try to reveal properly the evolution of Rowe's ideas, according to his critics' views and his thought reformations. We have shown that the Rowe's efforts to conclude the existence of actual gratuitous evils from the existence of the some seemingly gratuitous ones is not correct, and that not to find the justification for some evils does not imply that they do not have any plausible justification at all.

Keywords: William L. Rowe, Problem of Evil, Gratuitous Evil, Evidential Argument of Evil

Email: bzarkandeh@gmail.com

^{1.} M. A. in Philosophy of religion, Allameh Tabataba'i University,

^{2.} Associate Professor, University of Tehran.

Email: amir_alizamani@ut.ac.ir

The Consistency of Peripatetic and Illuminationist Philosophical Approaches on Issue of the Soul in Ibn Sina's view

Shams Allah Seraj¹, Mahnaz Mozaffarifar² (*Received: 31 May 2015- Accepted: 9 December 2015*)

Abstract

The theories concerning the issue of the soul are so various in the history of philosophy. The nature of the soul, its originatedness or eternity and quality of its relationship the with the body are most controversial issues in philosophical and theological discussions. Ibn Sina, as a Peripatetic philosopher, in most of his writings, has accepted the Aristotle's views on the originatedness of the soul, but in some mystical treatises and also in his work Qasidat al-Ayniyah, there are phrases which do imply his tendency to the Platonic view of the eternity of the soul. This raises a problematic for commentators of Ibn Sina, namely, how these two contradictory views apparently can be justified. The present paper examines the issue with descriptiveanalytic approach. It seems that there had been no change in Ibn Sina's views in his oriental philosophy, and that he remains faithful to his previous thesis on the originatedness of the soul. Therefore, there is no difference between the Peripatetic and illuminationist p[hilosophical approaches of Ibn Sina on the issue of the soul.

Keywords: Ibn Sina, Mulla Sadra, The Soul, Peripatetic philosophy, Illumination philosophy.

^{1.} Assistant professor, Department of Philosophy, Faculty of Theology, University
of Ilam,Email: sh.safarlaki@mail.ilam.ac.ir

^{2.} PhD. Student of Islamic theology and Philosophy, University of Ilam.

A Critical Edition of Al-Jili's Treatise on the Forth Figure Al-Lame fi al-Shakl al-Rabe

Asadollah Fallahi¹ (Received: 15 February 2015- Accepted: 30 June 2015)

Abstract

For the first time in the history of logic, Abd al Razzaq Al-Jili (d. 570/1174), in the treatise Al-Lame fi al-Shakl al-Rabe, dealt with the modal syllogisms of the fourth figure. Previous to him, Dinha, the priest, and Ibn Salah Alhamadani had discussed the non-modal moods of the fourth figure. Jili's treatise deals only with simple modalities and ignores the complex ones. His pupil, Fakhr al-Din Al-Razi, like his master, neglected the complex moods of the figure, but denied Al-Jili's modalities for three moods. Al-Razi's pupil, Zayn al-Din Al-Kashshi, developed the complex moods of the fourth figure. After Afzal al-Din Al-Khunaji realized that negative particulars have conversions in some complex modalities, Athir al-Din Al-Abhari discovered three new valid moods in the modal fourth figure.

Keywords: Abd al-Razzaq al-Jili, Al-Lame fi al-Shakl al-Rabe, Fourth Figure, Syllogism, Modalities

^{1.} Associate Professor, Iranian Institute of Philosophy, Email: falahiy@yahoo.com

The Distinction of Two Aspects of Being in Ibn Sina

Mohammad Bagher Ghomi¹ (Received: 7 February 2015- Accepted: 30 June 2015)

(------

Abstract

Ibn Sina speaks repeatedly of the distinction between the specific (khas) being and the positive (ijabi) being; a distinction on the basis of which is his distinction of being and essence. Thence, the famous problem of the distinction of being and essence is applicable to this distinction too. The difficulty is this: if the specific being is 'being'? This is indeed a problem about essence: is there any sense of being present in Ibn Sina's understanding of essence? Based on the relation of the specific being to positive being, possible being, thingness, and essence, this paper is trying to explain that the distinction between specific and positive being in Ibn Sina is, indeed, a distinction between two aspects of being in its Greek sense; a distinction on the basis of which is the famous distinction of being and essence and has not been focused on in Greek philosophy.

Keywords: Being, Specific (Khas) Being, Positive (Ijabi) Being, Essence.

^{1.} PhD in Philosophy, University of Tehran,

The Nature and Varieties of Death in the Works of Saint Augustine

Ghasem Kakaie¹, Mahbuobeh Jabbareh Nasero² (*Received: 19 September 2015- Accepted: 9 December 2015*)

Abstract

As one of the most unfathomable mysteries human beings encounter with, death has always been one of the main concerns of great scholars and one of the major teachings of monotheistic religions. Augustine is one of the great scholars who reflect upon and talk about death. Interestingly, we do not face with a particular definition of death in Augustine's works. As a Platonic philosopher, he considers death as the separation of spirit from the body; As a Christian theologian, however, he opines that death is the consequence of sin and distance from God. In his works, one can find both some specific characteristics of natural death as well as characteristics of intentional death, which has an obvious manifestation in Augustine's own life. Even though he endeavors to know and introduce the nature and varieties of death, his sayings signify his inability to the knowledge of this great existential enigma. It is why that he wishes Adam and Eve had not captivated us with this predicament.

Key words: Death, Death of Body, Death of Soul, Intentional Death, Natural Death, Augustine.

^{1.} Professor of Islamic Philosophy and Mysticism, University of Shiraz.

^{2.} PhD Candidate in Comparative Philosophy, University of Qom.

The Critical Analysis of Jeff Jordan's View on Religious Experience and its Naturalistic Explanation

Mansour Nasiri¹ (Received: 8 April 2015- Accepted: 30 June 2015)

Abstract

If we discover an adequate naturalistic explanation for religious experience, will it diminish its evidentiary value? In response to this question, many thinkers such as C.D. Broad, Richard Swinburne and William Wainwright argue that an adequate naturalistic explanation cannot diminish religious experience evidentiary value unless it can be demonstrated that there is no God. In contrary to this, some such as Jeff Jordan insisted that the discovery of such explanation results in diminishing of its evidentiary value even though it cannot be demonstrated that there is no God. In this article, having examined the two views, I suggest a third one, according to which, there are two kinds of religious experiences, according to one, the religious experience has evidentiary value even though it can be explained naturalistically too.

Keywords: Religious Experience, Naturalistic Explanation of Religious Experience, Jeff Jordan, Richard Swinburne.

^{1.} Assistant Professor, Farabi Pardis, University of Tehran; Email: nasirimansour@ut.ac.ir